

Internal Audit Department

O R A N G E C O U N T Y
6th Largest County in the USA

RESULTS OF CONTINUOUS AUDITING USING CAATS: AUDITOR-CONTROLLER, HUMAN RESOURCES, & COUNTY PROCUREMENT OFFICE

AUDIT FOR DUPLICATE VENDOR PAYMENTS AND OTHER PERIODIC ROUTINES

(Cited as a Best Practice by the Institute of Internal Auditors)

For the Month:
April 2012

Duplicate Vendor Payments: We analyzed 26,725 vendor invoices paid in March 2012 amounting to about \$175 million and found 99.99% of the invoices were paid only once. Of the \$175 million vendor invoices, we identified one (1) potential duplicate payment made to vendors totaling \$300.

To date we have identified \$983,595 in duplicate vendor payments, of which \$970,101 or 99% has been recovered.

AUDIT NO: 1139-J
REPORT DATE: APRIL 30, 2012

Director: [Dr. Peter Hughes, MBA, CPA, CIA](#)
Deputy Director: [Eli Littner, CPA, CIA, CISA](#)
Senior Audit Manager: [Autumn McKinney, CPA, CIA, CISA](#)
Audit Manager: [Carol Swe, CPA, CIA, CISA](#)

RISK BASED AUDITING

GAO & IIA Peer Review Compliant – 2001, 2004, 2007, 2010



American Institute of Certified Public Accountants Award to Dr. Peter Hughes as 2010 Outstanding CPA of the Year for Local Government

GRC (Government, Risk & Compliance) Group 2010 Award to IAD as MVP in Risk Management



2009 Association of Certified Fraud Examiners' Hubbard Award to Dr. Peter Hughes for the Most Outstanding Article of the Year – Ethics Pays



2008 Association of Local Government Auditors' Bronze Website Award



2005 Institute of Internal Auditors' Award to IAD for Recognition of Commitment to Professional Excellence, Quality, and Outreach



ORANGE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS'
Internal Audit Department

GAO & IIA Peer Review Compliant - 2001, 2004, 2007, 2010

Providing Facts and Perspectives Countywide

RISK BASED AUDITING

Dr. Peter Hughes

Director

Ph.D., MBA, CPA, CCEP, CITP, CIA, CFE, CFF

Certified Compliance & Ethics Professional (CCEP)

Certified Information Technology Professional (CITP)

Certified Internal Auditor (CIA)

Certified Fraud Examiner (CFE)

Certified in Financial Forensics (CFF)

Chartered Global Management Accountant (CGMA)

E-mail: peter.hughes@iad.ocgov.com

Eli Littner

Deputy Director

CPA, CIA, CFE, CFS, CISA

Certified Fraud Specialist (CFS)

Certified Information Systems Auditor (CISA)

Michael J. Goodwin

Senior Audit Manager

CPA, CIA

Alan Marcum

Senior Audit Manager

MBA, CPA, CIA, CFE

Autumn McKinney

Senior Audit Manager

CPA, CIA, CISA, CGFM

Certified Government Financial Manager (CGFM)

Hall of Finance & Records

12 Civic Center Plaza, Room 232
Santa Ana, CA 92701

Phone: (714) 834-5475

Fax: (714) 834-2880

To access and view audit reports or obtain additional information about the OC Internal Audit Department, visit our website: www.ocgov.com/audit



OC Fraud Hotline (714) 834-3608

Letter from Director Peter Hughes

Transmittal Letter



Audit No. 1139-J April 30, 2012

TO: Jan Grimes, Chief Deputy Auditor-Controller
Terri Bruner, Interim Director, Human
Resources Department
Ronald C. Vienna, County Purchasing Agent
County Procurement Office

SUBJECT: Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS:
Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, &
County Procurement Office – Duplicate
Vendor Payments & Other Routines

We have completed the April 2012 report of Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS (Computer-Assisted Audit Techniques). The final report is attached for your information. Recoveries to date from duplicate vendor payments are **\$970,101**.

Each month I submit an **Audit Status Report** to the Board of Supervisors (BOS) where I detail any material and significant audit issues released in reports during the prior month and the implementation status of audit recommendations as disclosed by our Follow-Up Audits. Accordingly, the results of this audit will be included in a future status report to the BOS.

As always, the Internal Audit Department is available to partner with your staff so that they can successfully implement or mitigate difficult audit recommendations. Please feel free to call me should you wish to discuss any aspect of our audit report.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by the personnel of your offices. If we can be of further assistance, please contact me or Eli Littner, Deputy Director at (714) 834-5899, or Autumn McKinney, Senior Audit Manager at (714) 834-6106.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Peter Hughes". The signature is fluid and cursive.

Dr. Peter Hughes, CPA, Director
Internal Audit Department

Attachment

Letter from Director Peter Hughes

Distribution Pursuant to Audit Oversight Committee Procedure No. 1:

Members, Board of Supervisors
Members, Audit Oversight Committee
Thomas G. Mauk, County Executive Officer
Victoria Ross, Senior Manager, Auditor-Controller/Claims & Disbursing Section
Bill Malohn, A-C/Information Technology/CAPS G/L System Support
Bob Leys, Assistant Director, Human Resources/Services and Support
Rosie Santiesteban, Administrative Manager, Human Resources/Administration
Foreperson, Grand Jury
Susan Novak, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

Table of Contents

***Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS:
Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, & County Procurement Office
Duplicate Vendor Payments and Other Routines
Audit No. 1139-J***

***For the Month:
April 2012***

Transmittal Letter	i
OC Internal Auditor's Report	1
OBJECTIVES	1
BACKGROUND	2
SCOPE	2
RESULTS	3
DETAILED RESULTS	
1. DUPLICATE PAYMENTS (OBJECTIVE #1)	4
2. EMPLOYEE VENDOR MATCH (OBJECTIVE #2)	5
3. OC WORKING RETIREE/EXTRA HELP HOURS (OBJECTIVE #3)	5
4. PAYROLL DIRECT DEPOSITS (OBJECTIVE #4)	6

OC Internal Auditor's Report

Audit No. 1139-J

April 30, 2012

TO: Jan Grimes, Chief Deputy Auditor-Controller
Terri Bruner, Interim Director, Human Resources Department
Ronald C. Vienna, County Purchasing Agent,
County Procurement Office

FROM: Dr. Peter Hughes, CPA, Director
Internal Audit Department

SUBJECT: Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS:
Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, & County Procurement
Office – Duplicate Vendor Payments and Other Routines

Audit Highlight

We analyzed 26,725 vendor invoices paid in March 2012 amounting to about \$175 million and found 99.99% of the invoices were only paid once.

Of the \$175 million vendor invoices, we identified one (1) potential duplicate payment made to vendors totaling \$300.

To date we have identified **\$983,595** in duplicate vendor payments, of which **\$970,101** or **99%** has been recovered.

OBJECTIVES

Each month, the Internal Audit Department conducts a variety of continuous auditing of vendor payment and payroll activity utilizing Computer-Assisted Audit Techniques (known by the acronym CAAT). Our objectives are to analyze selected vendor payment and payroll data to identify:

1. **Duplicate Payments:** Duplicate payments made to vendors. This CAAT is performed monthly.
2. **Employee Vendor Match:** Employees that bought goods or issued contracts to themselves or a related vendor. This CAAT is performed quarterly.
3. **OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:** County retirees working as extra help in excess of mandated hour limits of 960 or 720 hours for FY 11-12. The mandated limits required by Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04 are per fiscal year and this CAAT is performed monthly and annually.
4. **Payroll Direct Deposits:** Multiple employee paychecks directly deposited to the same bank account which could be an indicator of inappropriate payments. This CAAT is performed monthly.

OC Internal Auditor's Report

BACKGROUND

Continuous auditing is a change to the traditional audit approach of periodic reviews of a sample of transactions to ongoing audit testing of 100 percent of transactions. Continuous auditing provides efficient and timely testing of transactions and/or controls to allow immediate notification and remediation by management. An important component of continuous auditing is the development of models for the ongoing (continuous) review of transactions at, or close to, the point at which they occur.

As a supplement to traditional audits performed, Internal Audit performs continuous auditing of selected vendor payment and payroll activities utilizing Computer Assisted Audit Techniques (CAATs).

CAATs are automated queries applied to large amounts of electronic data searching for specified characteristics. We use a proprietary, best practices and industry recognized software product to help us in this process.

CAATs differ from our traditional audits in that CAATs can query **100%** of a data universe whereas the traditional audits typically test but a **sample** of transactions from the population.

Resulting exceptions or findings are forwarded to the appropriate department for validation and/or resolution. Depending on the department's review, the exceptions may or may not be a finding.

Often there is additional data needed to validate the exception that is only known at the department level. We also partner with the departments to identify internal control enhancements with the purpose of preventing future occurrences of the type of findings identified by the CAATs.

We are keeping the details of our process and the vulnerabilities identified to a general discussion because of the risks associated with disclosing specific details of our financial and accounting processes.

SCOPE

This report details the CAAT work we performed in April 2012. Our analysis included a review of the following data:

1. **Duplicate Payments:** 26,725 vendor invoices totaling \$174,917,763 for potential duplicate payments.
2. **Employee Vendor Match:** 39,402 employee and 15,801 vendor addresses and phone numbers at 3/31/12 for potential matches.
3. **OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:** County working retiree/extra help hours worked during FY 11/12 for individuals exceeding annual fiscal year limits of 960 or 720 hours, as mandated by Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04.
4. **Payroll Direct Deposits:** 53,883 payroll direct deposit transactions processed for pay periods #5 (2/10/12 – 2/23/12), #6 (2/24/12 – 3/8/12), and #7 (3/9/12 – 3/22/12) for suspicious direct deposit activity.

OC Internal Auditor's Report

RESULTS

For the month of April 2012, we found the following:

■ **Objective #1 - Duplicate Payments:**

We identified one (1) duplicate payment totaling \$300 made to vendors of the **\$175 million** of vendor invoices processed during March 2012.

Value-added Information

Based on the to-date recoveries of **\$970,101** from the duplicate vendor payment routine, these computer assisted routines have paid for themselves and are returning monies to the County that may otherwise be lost. To date, we have issued 119 monthly performance reports for the CAATs.

■ **Objective #2 – Employee Vendor Match:**

At the quarter-end March 31, 2012, no potential employee-vendor conflicts were identified in the employee-vendor matches we reviewed.

■ **Objective #3 – OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:**

As of April 5, 2012, no working retirees exceeded the annual fiscal year limits of 960 or 720 hours for FY 11/12, as mandated by Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04.

■ **Objective #4 – Payroll Direct Deposits:**

Analysis performed with no findings noted.

See the Detailed Results section for further information.



1. Duplicate Payments (Objective #1)

We used a CAAT routine to identify potential duplicate payments made to vendors during March 2012.

A. Results

We identified one (1) potential duplicate payment made to vendors totaling \$300 or .0002% of the \$175 million of vendor invoices processed during March 2012. The Auditor-Controller continues to investigate all duplicate payments and is pursuing collection. Currently, the County has a recovery rate of about **99%** on these duplicate payments that have been identified since the inception of the CAAT routines.

The table below summarizes the duplicate payment activity to date:

CAAT Report	Total		Not Duplicates		Recovered		In Process	
	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s
2002	103	\$99,980	19	\$10,334	80	\$87,808	4	\$1,838
2003	50	\$33,306	7	\$10,175	39	\$21,020	4	\$2,111
2004	33	\$105,779	7	\$2,990	24	\$101,460	2	\$1,329
2005	67	\$80,162	2	\$668	64	\$78,472	1	\$1,022
2006	75	\$347,008	16	\$33,720	55	\$311,279	4	\$2,009
2007	93	\$99,999	12	\$8,411	78	\$90,920	3	\$668
2008	70	\$77,712	11	\$6,794	57	\$68,718	2	\$2,200
2009	100	\$155,529	10	\$30,173	90	\$125,356	0	\$0
2010	40	\$84,059	7	\$8,050	29	\$74,517	4	\$1,492
2011	22	\$9,351	0	\$0	22	\$9,351	0	\$0
January 2012	2	\$1,200	0	\$0	2	\$1,200	0	\$0
February 2012	4	\$165	0	\$0	0	\$0	4	\$165
March 2012	2	\$360	0	\$0	0	\$0	2	\$360
April 2012	1	\$300	0	\$0	0	\$0	1	\$300
TOTAL	662	\$1,094,910	91	\$111,315	540	\$970,101	31	\$13,494

B. Background

This CAAT routine concentrates on a sub-set of vendor invoices paid by the County that possesses certain common attributes. The sub-set excludes one-time payments (such as election worker pay, jury duty pay, etc.) as well as recurring payments (periodic payments to the same payee for the same amount such as welfare, family support, etc.).

During the month of April 2012, 26,725 invoices for \$174,917,763 were added to this data sub-set representing March 2012 transactions. Currently, the data sub-set includes 1,008,055 invoices totaling \$10,681,493,695. The total data file from which the sub-set is derived includes 2,308,773 records totaling \$23,816,265,536. For FY 10-11, established vendor payments were about \$2.4 billion.

Our prior research has indicated that the duplicate payments are typically caused by a compounded human clerical error.



2. Employee Vendor Match (Objective #2)

We used a CAAT routine to identify employees that share a similar address or phone number as a vendor. This may identify employees buying goods or issuing contracts to themselves or a related vendor. This routine is performed quarterly.

Status:

We performed an analysis of employee and vendor addresses and phone numbers at quarter-end March 31, 2012. No potential employee-vendor conflicts were identified in the employee-vendor matches we reviewed. Our next analysis will be performed at quarter-end June 30, 2012.

3. OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours (Objective #3)

We performed an analysis of working retiree hours to identify retirees working as extra help in excess of Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04 mandated limits. Our criteria are 960 hours (maximum allowed for regular retirees) or 720 hours (maximum for early retirees) during the fiscal year (FY) 2011-2012.

Status:

The Government Code Section 31680.6 and 31641.04 mandated limits are per fiscal year and we perform this review monthly. As of April 5, 2012, there were 142 OC working retirees with hours; non-County working retirees are excluded from these totals (e.g. Superior Court, OCERS, LAFCO, etc.). As of April 5, 2012, no OC working retiree exceeded the annual fiscal year limits.

For FY 11-12, as of April 5, 2012, OC working retiree/extra-help data is:

Department	No. of OC Working Retirees	FY 11-12 Hours to Date
Sheriff-Coroner	75	38,929
District Attorney	23	11,177
Health Care Agency	13	6,341
Assessor	11	5,164
Probation	8	2,484
OC Public Works	2	1,614
County Counsel	2	1,146
Treasurer-Tax Collector	1	643
Human Resources	2	488
Auditor-Controller	1	318
Social Services Agency	2	180
Clerk of the Board	1	131
Child Support Services	1	32
Total	142	68,647



4. Payroll Direct Deposits (Objective #4)

We used a CAAT to identify multiple employee paychecks directly deposited to the same bank account in the same pay period. We review results to determine there has been no irregular direct deposit activity. For FY 10-11, direct deposits for regular payroll were about \$1.3 billion.

Results:

This CAAT was applied in April 2012 with no significant findings.

Attachments:

Details of Duplicate Payments provided to the Auditor-Controller/Claims & Disbursing Section, dated April 19, 2012.